

H-France Review Vol. 11 (August 2011), No. 189

Gérard Sabatier and Margarita Torrione, eds., *¿Louis XIV espagnol? Madrid et Versailles, images et modèles*. Versailles and Paris, Centre de recherche du château de Versailles; Éditions de la Maison des sciences de l'homme. Collection Aulica. 2009. 341 pp. Notes, illustrations, index. 43.00€ (cl). ISBN 978-2-7351-1244-9.

Review by Jeroen Duindam, Leiden University.

King of France and epitome of the Bourbon dynasty, Louis XIV was genetically as much a Habsburg as a Bourbon scion. Did the French court, with its *dévôt* faction and intricate ceremonies, imitate a Spanish model? This has long been taken for granted: Louis XIV's court appeared as the culminating point of courtly traditions from Burgundy, Charles V and Philip II, finally eclipsing its Spanish model and rival in the 1660s. Conversely, the French and Spanish court traditions have been pictured as mirror images, with Spanish austerity, reticence and religion set against French exuberance, accessibility and worldliness.^[1] The volume under review, addressing these questions primarily in terms of representation and images, is a welcome contribution to scholarship that seeks to reach beyond such facile reputations. In October 2004, Gérard Sabatier, Margarita Torrione and Fernando Checa co-organized a conference on Louis XIV and Spanish influences: the current volume reflects the results of this conference. Sabatier (emeritus, Université Pierre Mendès-France, Grenoble) published a major study on the artistic program of Versailles and a more general assessment of Valois and Bourbon "stratégies figuratives."^[2] He contributes a brief evocative introduction as well as a substantial conclusion to the current volume; his co-editor Margarita Torrione (Université de Savoie), whose publications and editions deal largely with Spanish-French connections and court festivals, contributes a single chapter.

Both in terms of the affiliations of contributors and the themes of chapters, France is more strongly represented than Spain; this matches the volume's intention to trace Spanish influences on Louis XIV and his court. *¿Louis XIV espagnol?* is structured in three parts: "Réprésentations," with five chapters discussing portraits and statues in France and Spain; "Usages de cour," bringing together six chapters with themes ranging from spatial organization, court life, the monarch's personal attitudes, and court fashion to the attitude of nobles vis-à-vis their ruler; and finally "Religion et imaginaires," including five chapters on the French court dealing with its religious calendar, with Louis XIV's piety and his messianism, the role of Spanish literary models in the education of the royal children, and images of Louis XIV and Philip V in popular literature during the War of Spanish Succession. Illustrations accompany the text throughout the book, and there is a separate section with forty well-chosen and beautifully reproduced colour plates.

The sixteen contributions on the whole reflect careful scholarship. They represent a pleasant mixture of historical, art-historical and literary perspectives and help to reassess overstated contrasts. I can mention only a few examples here. While Fernando Checa reviews and largely confirms the dominance of dynastic continuity, *gravitas* and the theme of "hidden kingship" in Spanish royal portraits, Miguel Morán Turina underlines changes and adaptability in the style of portraiture under Charles II. New strategies had to be designed to represent a weak minor under the tutelage of a dowager-queen; previous pictorial conventions were transcended in the process. Luis Sanchez, in a chapter on "l'espace du roi" at the Spanish court, stresses that the Spanish kings were never as sacralized as their French fellow-monarchs and cultivated the image of the warrior rather than that of the priest-king. In her chapter, Béatrix Saule puts into perspective the tempting opposition between a Spanish *roi caché* and the *roi soleil* as the ever-accessible ruler. Alexandre Maral points to the liturgical calendar as main structuring format of the French court—no surprise for

specialists in the field but certainly a useful corrective to the overstated “worldly” image of the French court. Bernard Hours, author of an important study on Louis XV, on the other hand, underlines the somewhat instrumental nature of Louis XIV’s personal religion: this was a “piété pour les regards.”[3] Margarita Torrión, co-editor of the volume, notes the strong presence of Spanish and Italian in France and the place of these languages in the education of princes. Don Quixote certainly was a great hit at court in education as well as in festivities; Torrión describes a carnival in 1700 with the *grand dauphin* dancing a *courante* as Sancho Panza with a gaucherie so fitting that it delighted his elderly father.

Most contributions are relatively detailed and focus on a single side of the Franco-Spanish connection. An intelligent reassessment of one side of the equation can incidentally go together with a restatement of clichés for the other side. Thus, Antonio Álvarez-Ossorio Alvarriño implicitly restates truisms about Louis XIV’s taming of the courtiers in his “Versailles inversé”, an interesting discussion of the vulnerable position of Charles II vis-à-vis the Spanish nobles. The lack of comparative papers in the volume, moreover, leaves Sabatier with the task of plausibly bringing together the materials in a synthetic conclusion. This he does with verve and pertinence. His epilogue refutes many classic instances of Spanish influence on France, deflates overstated contrasts, and sensibly stresses the *fond commun européen* (p. 308) of European court life. Sabatier underlines various differences emerging from contributions to the volume and adds his own analyses. Versailles, he points out, was the opposite rather than the imitation of the Escorial, which in any case never became the fixed residence of Spanish kings. Moreover, while Spanish kings put a premium on dynastic continuity and genealogy, the representation of Louis XIV focused on the present rather than on his predecessors. Yet, Sabatier argues, in some respects the “hiératisme” of Spanish portraiture reached its highest stage at Versailles (p. 307).

Sabatier’s remark about the *fond commun européen*, however, also points to an important limitation of this volume: it focuses on the bilateral Franco-Spanish connection, whereas court styles necessarily evolved through permanent and multilateral transfer of images and models. The Italian courts from the fifteenth into the eighteenth centuries formed a powerful example, connected intimately with Spain, France, and the south of the Holy Roman Empire. Likewise, Flemish artists can be found in the staff registers of most courts. A more fundamental complication undermines the Franco-Spanish perspective. The *Casa de Austria* notably included the Austrian Habsburgs successfully defending their semi-hereditary hold on the imperial dignity. After the death of Philip IV of Spain (1665), arguably the key dynastic battle of images was waged between Vienna and Versailles, where Philip IV’s daughters resided as spouses of Leopold I and Louis XIV respectively. The sequence of lavish festivities organized by these dynastic champions reflected a competition in which the Spanish heritage served as a much-coveted prize.

The imperial connection is present in the volume: Charles V, the last king of Spain holding the imperial crown, figures frequently; Maximilian I is mentioned in Checa’s chapter as a pioneer in representation (pp. 17-18, 24)[4]; Françoise Tétart-Vittu refers to the Burgundian as well as the imperial-Viennese aspects of ceremony and dress (p. 216). However, these authors do not move beyond brief references. Only Hendrik Ziegler—it can hardly be a coincidence that he is the single contributor based in a German university—integrates Leopold I more squarely into his discussion of the lion and the globe as symbols of power. Moreover, this author also includes Rome as a locus of courtly competition.[5] Whether or not we see the Austrian Habsburgs as the increasingly dominant element within the *Casa de Austria*, they can hardly be isolated from the discussion of Franco-Spanish influences. European dynasties intertwined continuously; spouses moved around the continent bringing their households as well as traditions, and an increasingly dense circulation of print and images showed the splendours of one court to its rivals. A strictly bilateral discussion of influences, therefore, can never be conclusive. National history, or the combination of national histories, has a limited potential to solve questions that are inherently transnational. This limitation of the volume under review is intimately connected to another: English-language literature on royal power and “absolutism” and German publications on courts and capitals could have been integrated more thoroughly. Even the *grand siècle* and the *roi soleil* can no longer be studied on the basis largely of French publications.

These critical remarks leave unscathed the generally positive impression of this volume as an empirically rich reassessment of Louis XIV's Spanish connections. The variety of the contributions and the numerous relevant illustrations make this an attractive book, mostly for a specialized audience, but possibly also for the general reader. Sabatier's conclusion, moreover, crowns the volume's otherwise somewhat disparate chapters with a strong and coherent statement.

LIST OF ESSAYS

Gérard Sabatier, "Il était de France, mais d'Espagne tout autant"

Fernando Checa, "Comment se représente un Habsbourg d'Espagne?"

Miguel Morán Turina, "Le portrait royal à l'espagnole sous Philippe IV et Charles II"

Stanis Perez, "Quelques poils au bas de la bouche ou les enjeux du portrait du roi"

Hendrik Ziegler, "Le lion et le globe: la statue de Louis XIV par Domenico Guidi, ou l'Espagne humiliée"

Diane H. Bodart, "Statues royales et géographie du pouvoir sous les règnes de Charles II et de Louis XIV"

José Luis Sancho, "L'espace du roi à la cour d'Espagne sous les Habsbourg"

Antonio Álvarez-Ossorio Alvariño, "Versailles inversé: Charles II, ou la monarchie sous l'empire des nobles"

Antonio Álvarez-Ossorio Alvariño, "La chapelle royale dans l'Alcázar de Madrid: un espace courtisan"

Béatrix Saule, "Les usages de cour à Madrid et à Versailles"

Xavier Le Person, "Un souverain sans gravité, Louis XIV et sa famille (vers 1680)"

Françoise Tétart-Vittu, "À l'espagnole ou à la française: résistances et emprunts dans la mode de cour"

Alexandre Maral, "Le système dévotionnel de Louis XIV à Versailles"

Bernard Hours, "De la piété personnelle de Louis XIV"

Sylvène Édouard, "Le messianisme de Louis XIV: un modèle espagnol?"

Margarita Torrión, "L'Espagne dans l'éducation des enfants de France: Don Quichotte, le miles gloriosus de Philippe d'Anjou, 1693"

Céline Gilard, "Philippe V et Louis XIV: héroïsme et imaginaire populaire dans la littérature de colportage pendant la guerre de Succession d'Espagne"

Gérard Sabatier, "1715: Que reste-t-il des Pyrénées?"

NOTES

[1] See discussion of previous literature on courts and influences in my socio-institutional comparison of the French and Austrian Habsburg courts, Jeroen Duindam, *Vienna and Versailles. The*

Courts of Europe's Dynastic Rivals 1550-1780 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), and a more specific discussion of the Burgundian-Habsburg-French connection in Duindam, 'The Burgundian-Spanish legacy in European court life: a brief reassessment and the example of the Austrian Habsburgs', *Publications du Centre Europeen d'études Bourguignonnes (XIVe-XVIIe s.). Rencontre d'Innsbruck*, 46 (2006) pp. 203-220; a wide-ranging recent contribution on models and influences in European court life: Werner Paravicini, Jörg Wettlaufer, ed., *Vorbild, Austausch, Konkurrenz. Höfe und Residenzen in der gegenseitigen Wahrnehmung. Herausgegeben von der Residenzen-Kommission der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen* (Ostfildern: Thorbecke Verlag, 2010).

[2] Gérard Sabatier, *Versailles ou la figure du Roi* (Paris: Albin Michel, 1999); *Le prince et les arts: Stratégies figuratives de la monarchie française de la Renaissance à l'âge baroque* (Seysssel: Champ Vallon, 2010); see also his chapter in Allan Ellenius, ed., *Iconography, Propaganda, and Legitimation* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1998). Fernando Checa, who co-organized the 2004 conference with Sabatier and Torrione, also contributed to the Ellenius volume.

[3] Bernard Hours, *Louis XV et sa cour. Le roi, l'étiquette et le courtisan* (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 2002).

[4] See e.g., on Maximilian's representation Larry Silver, *Marketing Maximilian: The Visual Ideology of a Holy Roman Emperor* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 2008); on Leopold Maria Goloubeva, *The Glorification of Emperor Leopold I. in Image, Spectacle and Text* (Mainz: Philipp von Zabern Verlag 2000) Veröffentlichungen des Instituts für Europäische Geschichte, vol. 184 and Jutta Schumann, *Die andere Sonne. Kaiserbild und Medienstrategien im Zeitalter Leopolds I* (Berlin: Akademie Verlag, 2003).

[5] Hendrik Ziegler's lavishly illustrated arthistorical study, *Der Sonnenkönig und Seine Feinde. Die Bilderpropaganda Ludwigs XIV. in der Kritik* (Petersberg: Michael Imhof Verlag, 2010) confirms his broader approach.

Jeroen Duindam
Leiden University
j.f.j.duindam@hum.leidenuniv.nl

Copyright © 2011 by the Society for French Historical Studies, all rights reserved. The Society for French Historical Studies permits the electronic distribution of individual reviews for nonprofit educational purposes, provided that full and accurate credit is given to the author, the date of publication, and the location of the review on the H-France website. The Society for French Historical Studies reserves the right to withdraw the license for edistribution/republication of individual reviews at any time and for any specific case. Neither bulk redistribution/ republication in electronic form of more than five percent of the contents of H-France Review nor re-publication of any amount in print form will be permitted without permission. For any other proposed uses, contact the Editor-in-Chief of H-France. The views posted on H-France Review are not necessarily the views of the Society for French Historical Studies.

ISSN 1553-9172